

Earth, Water, Ice and Fire:
Two Hundred Years of Geological Research in the English Lake District

Geological Society Memoirs
Society Book Editors
A. J. FLEET (CHIEF EDITOR)
P. DOYLE
F. J. GREGORY
J. S. GRIFFITHS
A. J. HARTLEY
R. E. HOLDSWORTH
A. C. MORTON
N. S. ROBINS
M. S. STOKER
J. P. TURNER

Society Publication reviewing procedures

The Society makes every effort to ensure that the scientific and production quality of its books matches that of its journals. Since 1997, all book proposals have been refereed by specialist reviewers as well as by the Society's Books Editorial Committee. If the referees identify weaknesses in the proposal, these must be addressed before the proposal is accepted.

Once the book is accepted, the Society has a team of Book Editors (listed above) who ensure that the volume editors follow strict guidelines on refereeing and quality control. We insist that individual papers can only be accepted after satisfactory review by two independent referees. The questions on the review forms are similar to those for *Journal of the Geological Society*. The referees' forms and comments must be available to the Society's Book Editors on request.

Although many of the books result from meetings, the editors are expected to commission papers that were not presented at the meeting to ensure that the book provides a balanced coverage of the subject. Being accepted for presentation at the meeting does not guarantee inclusion in the book.

Geological Society Publications are included in the ISI Index of Scientific Book Contents, but they do not have an impact factor, the latter being applicable only to journals.

More information about submitting a proposal and producing Society Publications can be found on the Society's web site: www.geolsoc.org.uk.

GEOLOGICAL SOCIETY MEMOIR No. 25

Earth, Water, Ice and Fire:
Two Hundred Years of
Geological Research in the
English Lake District

BY

DAVID OLDROYD

School of History and Philosophy of Science
The University of New South Wales, Australia

2002

Published by
The Geological Society
London

THE GEOLOGICAL SOCIETY

The Geological Society of London (GSL) was founded in 1807. It is the oldest national geological society in the world and the largest in Europe. It was incorporated under Royal Charter in 1825 and is Registered Charity 210161.

The Society is the UK national learned and professional society for geology with a worldwide Fellowship (FGS) of 9000. The Society has the power to confer Chartered status on suitably qualified Fellows, and about 2000 of the Fellowship carry the title (CGeol). Chartered Geologists may also obtain the equivalent European title, European Geologist (EurGeol). One fifth of the Society's fellowship resides outside the UK. To find out more about the Society, log on to www.geolsoc.org.uk.

The Geological Society Publishing House (Bath, UK) produces the Society's international journals and books, and acts as European distributor for selected publications of the American Association of Petroleum Geologists (AAPG), the American Geological Institute (AGI), the Indonesian Petroleum Association (IPA), the Geological Society of America (GSA), the Society for Sedimentary Geology (SEPM) and the Geologists' Association (GA). Joint marketing agreements ensure that GSL Fellows may purchase these societies' publications at a discount. The Society's online bookshop (accessible from www.geolsoc.org.uk) offers secure book purchasing with your credit or debit card.

To find out about joining the Society and benefiting from substantial discounts on publications of GSL and other societies world-wide, consult www.geolsoc.org.uk, or contact the Fellowship Department at: The Geological Society, Burlington House, Piccadilly, London W1J 0BG; Tel. +44 (0)20 7434 9944; Fax +44 (0)20 7439 8975; Email: enquiries@geolsoc.org.uk.

Published by The Geological Society from:
The Geological Society Publishing House
Unit 7, Brassmill Enterprise Centre
Brassmill Lane
Bath BA1 3JN, UK

(Orders: Tel. +44 (0)1225 445046
Fax +44 (0)1225 442836)

Online bookshop: <http://bookshop.geolsoc.org.uk>

The publishers make no representation, express or implied, with regard to the accuracy of the information contained in this book and cannot accept any legal responsibility for any errors or omissions that may be made.

© The Geological Society of London 2002. All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission. No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with the provisions of the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 9HE. Users registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, 27 Congress Street, Salem, MA 01970, USA: the item-fee code for this publication is 0435-4052/02/\$15.00.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 1-86239-107-6
ISSN 0435-4052

Typeset by Type Study, Scarborough, UK
Printed by Alden Press, Oxford, UK

Distributors

USA

AAPG Bookstore
PO Box 979
Tulsa
OK 74101-0979

USA

Orders: Tel. +1 918 584-2555
Fax +1 918 560-2652
E-mail bookstore@aapg.org

India

Affiliated East-West Press PVT Ltd
G-1/16 Ansari Road, Daryaganj,
New Delhi 110 002

India

Orders: Tel. +91 11 327-9113
Fax +91 11 326-0538
E-mail affiliat@nda.vsnl.net.in

Japan

Kanda Book Trading Co.
Cityhouse Tama 204
Tsurumaki 1-3-10
Tama-shi
Tokyo 206-0034
Japan

Orders: Tel. +81 (0)423 57-7650
Fax +81 (0)423 57-7651

Contents

Preface and Acknowledgements	vi
Introduction	1
Chapter 1 In the beginning	3
Chapter 2 Adam in Lakeland	13
Chapter 3 Robert Harkness, Henry Alleyne Nicholson and Charles Lapworth	27
Chapter 4 The first surveys	39
Chapter 5 John Marr and Alfred Harker	59
Chapter 6 Edward Walker, Robert Rastall, Frederick Green, John Hartley, George Mitchell and their work on Lakeland volcanics and structure	75
Chapter 7 Granites, garnets, the 'streaky' rocks and Mitchell's later work	93
Chapter 8 The Skiddaw graptolites	107
Chapter 9 The Skiddaw Slates and the Borrowdale Volcanics	121
Chapter 10 From micro to macro: plate tectonics in the Lake District – a tangle of theories	141
Chapter 11 Gravity, geomagnetism and granites	153
Chapter 12 Some more PhDs, and the extension of Lakeland surveying in the 1970s	161
Chapter 13 The stratigraphy of 'Otley III'	171
Chapter 14 The great collaboration	187
Chapter 15 Collaborating on the Skiddaw Group	197
Chapter 16 Collaborating on the Borrowdale Volcanics and the granites	211
Chapter 17 Collaborating on the Windermere	231
Chapter 18 Tertiary uplift	243
Chapter 19 The glaciation of the Lake District	255
Chapter 20 Nirex and the great denouement	271
Chapter 21 Some concluding thoughts	289
References	297
Index	321

It is recommended that reference to all or part of this book should be made in the following way:

OLDROYD, D. 2002. *Earth, Water, Ice and Fire: Two Hundred Years of Geological Research in the English Lake District*. Geological Society, London, Memoirs, **25**.

Preface and Acknowledgments

This book was begun in 1996, and work on it continued through to 2001, with five summer seasons spent in the English Lake District and in British libraries. I called on and taped interviews with a considerable number of geologists (including three in Australia) who have worked in the Lakes or who continue to do so. My inquiries were financed by a grant from the Australian Research Council, to whom I am most grateful, in that it has indulged my penchant for mixing business with pleasure. I am also most grateful to the Geological Society for permitting me to publish such a book with their Publishing House; and to Diana Swan and Angharad Hills for attending to the editorial processes. Bernard Leake and Nigel Woodcock were sympathetic and most helpful referees, making it possible to weed out a number of solecisms, in addition to furnishing much valuable advice and information. I owe them a lot.

Interviews were conducted, or valuable conversations had, with the following persons: Peter Allen, Andrew Bell, Brett Beddoe-Stephens, Michael Branney, John Boardman, Martin Bott, Bob Chaplow, Richard Clark, Tony Cooper, Jack Soper, the late Sir Kingsley Dunham, Ronald Firman, Godfrey Fitton, Neil Fortey, Stuart Haszeldine, Douglas Holliday, Dennis Jackson, Louisa King, Colin Knipe, Peter Kokelaar, Benjamin Kneller, Colin Knipe, Michael Lee, Kenneth McNamara, Uisdean Michie, David Millward, Murray Mitchell, Stephen Molyneaux, Frank Moseley (who supervised my undergraduate work for a year), the late Robin Oliver, Michael Petterson, Tony Reedman, Barrie Rickards, Eric Robinson, Adrian Rushton, Tom Shipp, Eric Skipsey, Phil Stone, Tony Wadge, Barry Webb, Nigel Woodcock and Brian Young. Mervyn Dodd and Alan Smith were good enough to conduct me to some sites in the field also, and I enjoyed having the opportunity to participate in several excursions organized by the Cumberland and Westmorland Geological Societies, while Jack Soper enabled me to see what he got up to while mapping the Kendal Sheet. Many of the above have also assisted through subsequent correspondence. I am extremely indebted to all these people. Without them there would undoubtedly be no book to lay before the reader. Only three people I tried to contact failed to respond; and one other declined to become involved in the project.

Some others whom I was not able to meet personally have also been extremely helpful through correspondence, phone calls or personal conversations: Jim Briden, Norman Catlow, Andrew Chadwick, John Cope, Rudolf Daber, Robert Dott, Kenneth Glennie, Paul Green, David Holmes, Alan Hooper, Stephen Horseman, Richard Hughes, Peter Jeans, Eric Johnson, Bernard Leake, Cherry Lewis, Brian McConnell, Christopher McKeown, Klaus Michels, Richard Moore, Ted Neill, Michael Nutt, Helen Oliver, Vic Parsons, Jack Preston, Brinley Roberts, David Roberts, Eric Robinson, Celal Sengör, Vivien Simpson, David Skevington, David Smythe, Helen Reeves, Pauline Taylor, John Temple, Lorna Thomas, Chris Thompson, Jonathan Turner, Otfried Wagenbreth, Harry Wilson, Derek Woodhall and Kejian Wu. I am much indebted to these persons too. My colleague, David Miller, provided his usual judicious comment on various portions of my text.

The assistance of Misha Au-Yeung and Harshi Gunawardena,

who helped with bibliographical matters, is gratefully acknowledged. For references on Lakeland geology, the two bibliographies of Alan Smith have been indispensable. He was also good enough to take some photographs for me in the Hollows Farm area.

Ruth Banger, Simon Bennett, Moira Bent, Lilian Bew, Alan Bowden, Diana Chardin, Jon Clatworthy, Jeffrey Cowton, Hazel Davidson, Paul Davis, Michael Dorling, Peter Eyre, Jackie Fay, Stephen Hewitt, Richard Gillanders, Andrea Fazackerley, Brian Houghton, Martina Koelbl-Ebert, Bob McIntosh, Kate Manners, Mark Nicholls, Peter Nockles, Kate Perry, Jane Pirie, Emma Robinson, Mary Sampson, Claire Slater, Michael Smallman, Jonathan Smith, Pauline Taylor, Chris Terrey, Anne Thompson, Hugh Torrens and Michael Walton have provided valuable assistance in the matter of archival sources, information about Lakeland geologists and related matters, permissions, photographs of specimens, references, and library services. In this last regard, I should *particularly* like to thank the staff of the interlibrary loan service at The University of New South Wales (mostly anonymous), Wendy Cawthorne of the Geological Society's library, and Graham McKenna at the British Geological Survey for their invaluable assistance. Steve Preece, Janet Latham and Jane Oldroyd gave valued assistance with the preparation of the topographic maps. Special mention should be made of the late John Thackray, formerly Honorary Archivist at the Geological Society, who, during his last illness, made the effort to send me a copy of his transcription of an interview he had recorded with Tressilian Nicholas.

At the Geological Society Publishing House, Angharad Hills and Diana Swan have been of the greatest assistance to me, and I should also thank all those, with names unknown to me, who did the work necessary to turn my text and illustrations into a very presentable book. The work of Robert Holdsworth as overseeing editor of this book is also most gratefully acknowledged, as are the comments and advice of Bernard Leake and Nigel Woodcock as referees.

My wife, Jane Oldroyd, has been patient (and sometimes rightly impatient) with me over several years, and has assisted in all sorts of ways in the matter of computing problems.

The hospitality of numerous proprietors of bed-and-breakfast establishments in Britain is recorded with thanks. Among them, it is nice to remember Margaret Lamb at St Bees, whose nine-year-old daughter Harriet entertained with enchanting tap-dancing on the flags of their warm kitchen at breakfast time, not to mention playing the harp, violin and recorder for my benefit. Margaret herself (an itinerant music teacher) produced a cello from somewhere, and we were able to read through the great Brahms Piano Quartet, opus 25, with musician friends of hers in the village. At Keyworth, Anne Carnell made it possible for me to make repeated pleasant visits to the British Geological Survey. I almost became a member of the Carnell family. Graham McKenna effected the introduction.

In a book published in 1990, I thanked the middle fingers of my left and right hands for their stalwart work in typing my manuscript. Matters remained the same in 2002, and I should like to thank them both again.

A note on abbreviations, units, and maps

SS, Skiddaw Slates.

BVG, Borrowdale Volcanic Group.

CPT, Causey Pike Thrust.

'Otley I' is used as an approximate synonym for the Skiddaw Slates.

'Otley II' is used as an approximate synonym for the Borrowdale Volcanics Group.

'Otley III' is used as an approximate synonym for the Windermere Group or Windermere Supergroup.

Ma, million years.

Ka, thousand years

1 metre = 3.281 ft

1 kilometre = 0.6214 miles

1 yard = 3 ft

In the topographical maps, thin lines represent waterways. Thick lines represent roads (of unequal importance), coastlines or lake margins. Footpaths are not represented. Filled circles represent towns or villages, of unequal numbers of inhabitants. Filled triangles represent hilltops or mountain peaks, not all of equal topographic significance.

Units of length (feet, yards, miles, metres, kilometres) are given in accordance with the usage of the primary sources under discussion.